

End of Term Evaluation – Executive Summary
Nepal Earthquake Response Rehabilitation –
Aktion Deutschland Hilft (ADH – 5)
Sindhupalchowk and Gorkha, Nepal



Project Period: February 2017 - December 2017 (extended until 30th April 2018)
Data collected from 16th March 2018 - 25th April 2018

Submitted to World Vision Nepal in June 2018

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ADH	Aktion Deutschland Hilft
CTEVT	Council for Technical and Vocational Training
CV	Curriculum Vitae
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
EHA	Evaluating Humanitarian Action
GRLMA	Gender Responsive Labour Market Assessment
HEA	Humanitarian Emergency Affairs
LDRMC	Local Disaster Risk Management Committee
LDRMP	Local Disaster Risk Management Plan
LRRD	Linking Relief, Rehabilitation and Development
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
NERP	Nepal Earthquake Recovery Program
PPS	Probability proportional to size
ToR	Terms of Reference
VCA	Vulnerability capacity assessments
VDC	Village Development Committee
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene
WMC	Water Management Committee
WUC	Water User Committee
WV	World Vision
WVG	World Vision Germany

1. SHORT DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT AND CONTEXT

The Nepal Earthquake Response Rehabilitation Project (ADH-5) was implemented by World Vision Nepal in April 2016, funded by Aktion Deutschland Hilft (ADH). An extension to this project begun in February 2017, with activities concluded in December 2017. A no-cost extension was granted by World Vision Germany (WVG) until 30th April 2018.

On April 25, 2015, a 7.8-magnitude earthquake struck near Kathmandu, Nepal and was followed by a series of large aftershocks. The disaster, which affected over 8 million people, led to more than 9,000 deaths, and temporarily displaced 2.8 million people, prompting a significant response from the international community. As a result of the earthquakes, there was an estimated loss of 94,814,838 work days and USD 171 million in personal income. Given that annual labour earnings per household across Nepal were already low, this shock has had a significant impact on affected households; it is estimated that it pushed an additional 2.5-3.5% of the population into poverty. In response of that results, WV Nepal began livelihood, water sanitation and hygiene (WASH) and social protection cash interventions in April 2016, in two of the worst hit and most vulnerable districts of Sindhupalchowk and Gorkha as a part of the *Nepal Earthquake Response Rehabilitation Project*. The core of the *Nepal Earthquake Response Rehabilitation Project* is to strengthen the resilience and self-recovery and restore a sense of safety for earthquake affected children and their communities. Operating principles include:

- Integration of multiple sectors, agricultural production/marketing and rehabilitation of community assets
- Increasing community preparedness and resilience by mainstreaming disaster risk reduction (DRR)
- Communities being better prepared and resilient to respond to future disasters (including adopting Build Back Better construction methodology)
- Vulnerable populations having equal access and opportunity to benefit (gender equity and social inclusion)
- Linking relief, rehabilitation and development throughout the response
- Community accountability

The project outcomes are, that earthquake-affected families have strengthened their livelihoods and are better prepared and ability to manage future disasters and that they have improved living conditions including access to basic WASH services.

2. OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION

The primary purpose for this end of project evaluation is to assess how well the project achieved progress towards its goal and outcome and identify WV's contribution in the change. The key groups that were consulted included community groups and individuals, civil society organisations, and WV staff. The

evaluation adopted the Development Assistance Committee (DAC)-Criteria for Humanitarian Emergency Affairs (HEA)-Interventions to ensure relevance and consistency when evaluating humanitarian action (EHA). EHA is a systematic and impartial examination of humanitarian action intended to draw lessons to improve policy and practice and enhance accountability. The purpose of the end of project evaluation is to:

1. Assess how well the project achieved progress towards its goal and outcome and assess WV's contribution to these changes.
2. Identify opportunities for future programming and demonstrate WV's accountability to different stakeholders.

The scope of the evaluation encompasses ten objectives for the evaluation (five of which include DAC-Criteria), along with corresponding key evaluation questions.

3. METHODOLOGY OF THE EVALUATION

A document review (project design document, logframe and monitoring reports) was conducted to gather background information on the project and indicators. Household surveys were used to collect data from identified respondents to capture quantitative information around indicators from the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) plan. The aim was to have a survey that was simple to answer and record responses, and not take more than 60 minutes to complete.

The evaluation was conducted in 15 village development committees (VDCs) across Sindhupalchowk District (8) and Gorkha District (7). For quantitative data collection, the total sample frame for this assessment was 13,642 households. A random sampling approach was used. The total sample size included overlap between the livelihood, WASH and shelter sectors. District-wide sampling was calculated based on probability proportional to size (PPS) methodology. Households were selected at random from lists prepared from the earthquake rehabilitation activities. VDC sample sizes were calculated using equal household distribution approach.

For qualitative data collection, sampling of informants was appropriate to the resources available and relevant to the information sought from them. Focus group participants and key informants were purposively sampled by the evaluation team. Each focus group ranged from 8-10 participants and were of mixed gender. A total of 8 focus groups (four from each district) and five key informant interviews were conducted. Some of the groups consulted during the qualitative surveys were earthquake affected families, water management committees, farmer groups and local disaster management groups. The quantitative survey data were entered in Excel and subsequently cleaned. They were then exported to SPSS 24 for statistical analysis. Simple frequency tables were generated and presented. Where relevant, tests for associations were conducted. Qualitative data was analyzed narratively by the international consultant and national sector consultants

consistent with the team member roles stipulated in the Terms of reference (ToR). The results of the analysis were then incorporated in this report to generate an end of line evaluation.

4. KEY FINDINGS

Effectiveness

This section involves an analysis of the extent to which the stated intervention objectives have been met by presenting the quantitative and qualitative findings from the evaluation. This section begins presenting the quantitative findings with respect to whether the project has been effective in achieving its strategic objectives and intended outcomes. Greater analysis is provided in the impact section on the data results. The conclusions in this section are based on analysis of household survey data from the 15 sampled villages and stakeholder consultations at district and local levels and from comparisons made with baseline data.

Goal - To strengthen the resilience and self-recovery, and restore a sense of safety for earthquake affected children and their communities

Key indicators	Baseline	Endline
25% increase in absorptive resilience index (standardized) among target population	41.4%	72.8%
25% increase in adaptive resilience index (standardized) among target population	56.2%	85.3%
% of families who are satisfied with WV's response to their priority needs	83%	96.0%
% of families able to meet household monthly food expense	44.3%	76.9%
% of families (including most vulnerable) were able to meet their top 3 most important expenses	54.5%	93.2%
# of DRM plans developed/implemented	0	7
% of target population with access to an improved water source/potable water	51.9%	87.6%
% men, women, children who adopt key hygiene measures (CLTS/ZOD)	87.4%	88.0%

Impact

This section explores the wider effects of the project – social, economic, technical, environmental – on individuals, marginalised groups, communities and institutions – and what are the intended and unintended, positive and negative, effects at the macro (sector) and micro (household) level. The assessment looks at the longer-term consequences of achieving or not achieving project objectives, and the issue of wider socioeconomic change. Factors influencing impact have also been explored. As noted in the limitation section, the assessment of impact is limited by the fact that the evaluation has been carried out immediately after the intervention and that change in socioeconomic processes may take many months or even years to become apparent. In the case of the Nepal Earthquake Response Rehabilitation Project, the goal is “To

strengthen the resilience and self-recovery and restore a sense of safety for earthquake affected children and their communities". Two outcomes contribute to the achievement of the goal:

- Earthquake-affected families have restrengthened their livelihoods and are better prepared and able to manage future disasters
- Earthquake-affected communities and families, including children, have improved living conditions including access to basic WASH services

The impact of rehabilitation efforts in restoring short-term food security and assisting farmers to recover and restock agricultural assets, is worth noting, along with increased access to improved water sources. The quantitative survey has shown marked improvement in families able to meet household monthly food expenses and meet their top three most important expenses whilst also showing an observable and improved access to clean water sources. The project has been intentional in targeting vulnerable and marginalised households for greater access to credit and savings and in expanding their capabilities in enterprise development, sustainable livestock farming, crop production and linking with the market for a means of living. However, in terms of resilience building in the long term, it is too early to say whether transitioning agricultural groups from subsistence farming to commercialisation and in doing so, higher incomes, will be achieved. For communities to cope with the shocks that they are at risk of experiencing, the organisational and technical capacity of community groups, such as local disaster risk management committees (LDRMCs), savings groups and producer groups need to be intentionally strengthened.

a) Outcome 1 - Earthquake-affected families have restrengthened their livelihoods and are better prepared and able to manage future disasters

Agricultural Production - To stabilize agricultural production and increase food security, farmers were provided with agricultural inputs (such as seeds, tools, livestock and fertilizers) depending on their individual needs and land-size. As in the recovery phase, these inputs were provided through vouchers from local vendors to strengthen the local market. In discussions with producer groups in both Sindhupalchowk and Gorkha, and backed up in survey findings, it was revealed that agricultural producers had in general only modest increases to their production levels. Whilst 74.4 percent of households surveyed did increase agricultural production due to accessing inputs that were supplied by the project, such as improved seeds, and 38.1 percent of households increased agricultural production due to increased access to tools supplied by the project, yield increases of 5-10 percent were most common among respondents (27.2 percent for inputs and 11.6 percent for tools). WV Nepal staff and producer groups explained that low production levels were primarily due to there being only one harvest for cereals (wheat, rice) along with the delayed arrival of the monsoon. In addition, some of the agricultural inputs provided did not meet the expectation of the community – providing a tractor on terraced land made accessibility difficult. Delays in training due to local elections were also mentioned by WV NERP staff as a negative impact on agricultural production.

Commercial Farming - In addition to increasing agricultural productivity, the project also aimed to assist farmers to go beyond subsistence agriculture and generate an income. Activities supporting commercial farming have included mobilising local farmers into producer groups to support production of relevant commodities and improve sales. Facilitated through government departments and the Federation of Commerce and Industries, trainings were conducted on running agriculture as a business by teaching farmers business skills to assist them in making decisions on running a profitable enterprise. In other sessions, farmer groups and cooperatives were taught how to process products at the local level to increase value. In addition, women and economically disadvantaged people were taught and encouraged to work with cooperatives and collection centers to help them to achieve scale, consistency and bargaining power. Interventions have also taken place to assist farmers in organizing themselves and linking with important stakeholders like input suppliers and buyers which go beyond their home districts. It is commendable that in such a short time the project has assisted over three-quarters of all farmers to increase their yields. Further, 60.3 percent of all farmers surveyed experienced yield increases of up to 15 percent. Consequently, there is high prospect of transitioning from subsistence farming to commercialisation in the longer run as the project has worked with community people on one hand and government and private sectors on another to sustain project interventions. Linking community groups and people with local market will likely have a positive long-term impact to enhance and strengthen commercial farming.

Savings Groups – The post-disaster needs assessment cited a lack of savings by communities as a main barrier to respond to another disaster. This was particularly the case for women in Gorkha and Sindhupalchowk, who were facing a slow economic recovery due to limited cash savings at the time of the earthquake (just 28 percent in Gorkha and 30 percent in Sindhupalchowk). This was despite the existence of savings groups in communities. As part of the project, beneficiaries who had received agricultural input support were formed into savings groups and cooperatives, with the main purpose to support those who had no savings or limited access to formal financial service providers like banks or micro-finance institutions. It was remarked in several interviews with beneficiaries that providing small loans prevented people from borrowing money at high interest rates or resorting to livelihood-based coping strategies like selling livestock and assets to supplement their income. Data revealed that 96 percent of savings group members surveyed had increased knowledge from financial and business training and that 74.8 percent of households surveyed in Gorkha and Sindhupalchowk had started a savings habit.

Vocational Training and Labour Market Access – With limited options to generate income in the recovery phase, the project has sought to improve income through enterprise development, vocational training and increased labor market access. Training institutes provided Council for Technical and Vocational Training (CTEVT) certified training programs and non-certified training for vulnerable groups with special needs.

Beneficiaries were also provided with entrepreneurial and business training and micro-cash grants to further develop or start their own enterprise. A Gender Responsive Labour Market Assessment (GRLMA) was also developed to help gain firsthand knowledge about local employment opportunities, hiring trends, skills in demand, as well as a deeper understanding of the constraints job seekers face entering the labour market. Along with job seekers, findings were shared with education/training institutions in order to help tailor their courses to market needs. Job seekers were then provided with certified vocational training, opportunity to attend trade/job fairs, along with CV development, interview preparation and gender-sensitive career path development. Lower caste and women particularly were targeted as part of the selection criteria. A high percentage of respondents (85.9 percent) had an increased awareness on labour market opportunities due to dissemination of GRLMA findings. Although these findings seem to be skewed, given that 57.1 per cent of respondents in Gorkha and 93.8 percent of respondents in Sindhupalchowk reported the findings were helpful in exploring market opportunities. Further, the number of respondents in both districts differed widely; 35 in Gorkha and 129 in Sindhupalchowk. However, the reason behind the skewed result might be lower market access and opportunities in Gorkha comparing that with Sindhupalchowk. Since awareness in job and business opportunities was successful, many participants could apply knowledge gained in job creation and income generating activities in longer run.

Disaster Risk Reduction – A key element of the Nepal Earthquake Response Rehabilitation Strategy has been the mainstreaming of DRR activities. In discussions with project staff, it was revealed that the approach aims to help prevent new and reduce existing disaster risk through activities that reduce vulnerabilities and increase preparedness for response and recovery. The project leveraged existing local disaster risk management structures, which in most cases were not functional prior to the earthquake. WV Nepal has directly provided members with training in vulnerability capacity assessments (VCA) to complete LDRMP, as well as contracted out a training of trainer's program for example in first aid and search and rescue. Furthermore, the project distributed emergency kits that included medicine, helmets, jackets and first aid. The fact that completed LDRMP have exceeded 100 percent, yet the organisational capacity, commitment and motivation of the LDRMCs is relatively weak, while its reach into the community is limited, suggests significant follow up with the ward committees will be required to sustain DRR.

b) Outcome 2 - Earthquake-affected communities and families including children have improved living conditions including access to basic WASH services

WASH - The project has also demonstrated that a comprehensive approach to WASH can influence the health status of a community and be more effective than establishing infrastructure only. Over the past 15 months the project has gone beyond the installation of hardware. A combination of approaches including hygiene promotion, safer disposal, hand washing and maintaining drinking water free of contamination has been adopted. Whilst the health status in communities was not measured, interviews with earthquake-affected

communities have indicated that during the dry season, at least, cases of diarrhea have decreased. The importance of community involvement and ownership in the achievement of impact has also been noted. With the assistance of the local partner organizations, the WMC's have mobilised communities and provided in-kind contributions for the construction of water systems, including labourers, cash and materials. WMCs were trained in the daily operation and maintenance of the water systems and request monthly contributions from households on a user pays basis.

Factors influencing Impact

Local Elections - In 2016, local government elections took place, which impacted the project in two unintended ways. Firstly, the election commission of Nepal launched its election code of conduct, which was effective from 26th February 2017. The code of conduct was applicable for humanitarian agencies, including private and government line agencies and local partner NGOs. According to the code of conduct any type of mass gathering activities (which includes orientation, training, large-scale distributions) without prior approval from the election authority was not allowed. This impacted the timely implementation of project activities, including trainings. Additionally, construction materials could not be delivered at the construction site and construction workers were engaged in pre-election campaigns which affected the construction. The elections also resulted in the name change of the decision-making body in the community, from ward citizen forum to ward committees and the reform of the structure from a political body to an elected body. Whilst the shift facilitated the planned move towards greater inclusion and participation of vulnerable groups, rather than selection based on political allegiance, it highlighted that responding to and capitalizing on unplanned opportunities, such as capacity building and the institutional strengthening of emerging democratic institutions mid-way through project implementation

Sustainability has been adapted from the concept of connectedness – the idea that interventions should support longer-term goals, and eventually be managed without donor input. The project has partnered well with existing WMC or has established them where they do not exist, to take over the management and maintenance of the water system, for longer term sustainability in each of the 15 communities (seven in Gorkha and eight in Sindhupalchowk). Across both districts in the communities that were visited it was revealed that WMCs undertook a very active role in site selection, community contributions (in the form of cash, materials and labor), construction work and monitoring, as well as operation and maintenance. It was reported in focus groups with WMCs that this degree of involvement greatly increased ownership among communities of their water systems. Site observations revealed that taps were well maintained and generally operating effectively in each community visited. However, it was observed that one water source had dried up in Sindhupalchowk (Pipaldanda VDC). While exploring the reason behind this, the evaluation team realized that the assessment of the spring source was done during the rainy season which could not happen to be realistic for the dry season. Each WMC visited has been registered with the district drinking water supply and

sanitation division office and every household provides a voluntary monthly contribution of 50 Rupees per household to hire a person for daily management. Funds are held in the Water User Committee's (WUC) bank account.

In discussions with ward committees, WV Nepal has successfully worked to reactivate existing LDRMCs and link them to local governments to ensure the development of LDRMPs. These plans are beginning to enable the community to understand disaster risks specific to them and strengthen disaster risk governance for management of risk so that they are able to take action. WV Nepal has also trained community members on multi-hazard prevention, supporting the government in joint monitoring and establish community teams as early responders.

Support from local government however has been encouraging. Along with providing extension support, local government has proved to be a well-resourced partner. Through the registration of local community groups, local government has taken an active role in support. Upon approval of the LDRMP, local government has committed to providing funding to the LDRMC to implement their plan. In one community it was remarked that local government had already provided 100,000 Rupees to fund their LDRMP. Savings groups have been registered at the district agriculture development office to improve access to support and financial assistance.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

Organisational

Because of weaknesses in partner capacity in building sustainable community groups, there is a need for WV Nepal to conduct an internal review of capacity building and institutional activities with its partner NGOs as part of LRRD transition arrangements. This includes incorporating institutional factors in future rehabilitation strategies, specifically the existence of strong partnerships, and ensure local capacity is supported and developed.

Economic Empowerment

Because of no guaranteed job placements or apprenticeships as part of project activities, future employment support should include partnering with local government and the private sector with mentoring and job placement, and greater advocacy campaigns with local chambers of commerce to establish programs to provide employment assistance.

Project Quality

For effective inclusion, log frame indicators and results statements must be disaggregated by gender and social inclusion.